CRIMEAN HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION REVIEW

April 2020

The monitoring review was prepared by the Crimean Human Rights Group on the basis of materials collected in April 2020.

Follow the link to read Findings of monitoring the COVID-19 pandemic response in Crimea:


Follow the link to read monthly monitoring reviews of the Crimean Human Rights Group.

Follow the link to read thematic reviews and articles of the Crimean Human Rights Group.
CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................................. 2

2. CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS .................................................................................................. 3

   Right to liberty and security of the person ................................................................................... 3

   Searches and detentions ........................................................................................................... 3

   Politically motivated criminal prosecution .............................................................................. 3

   «Case of Crimean Muslims» ........................................................................................................ 3

   «Ukrainian saboteurs’ case» ........................................................................................................ 5

   Persecution for charging with being in N.Chelebidjikhan battalion .......................................... 5

   Oleg Prikhod’ko’s case ................................................................................................................ 6

   Confinement conditions in detention facilities ............................................................................ 6

   Freedom of thought, conscience and religion ............................................................................. 7

   Freedom of expression .................................................................................................................. 7

   Freedom of assembly and association ......................................................................................... 8

   Freedom of movement ................................................................................................................... 9

3. VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW ................................................. 10

   Geneva Convention (IV) relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons .................................... 10

   in Time of War

   Conscription of persons living in the occupied territory into armed forces ............................ 10

   of occupying power and propaganda of joining voluntarily the armed forces
1. INTRODUCTION

The Crimean Human Rights Group (CHRG) is an organization of the Crimean human rights defenders and journalists, the purpose of which is to promote the observance and protection of human rights in Crimea by attracting widespread attention to the problems of human rights and international humanitarian law in the territory of the Crimean peninsula, as well as the search and development of mechanisms to protect the human rights in Crimea.

The CHRG first of all obey the rules of basic documents in the field of human rights, such as: the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Helsinki Final Act, the Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and others.

The main objectives of the CHRG:

1) Collection and analysis of the information regarding the human rights situation in Crimea;
2) Broad awareness among governments, international organizations, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, the media and other target groups through the publication and spreading of analytical and information materials on the human rights situation in Crimea;
3) Promote the protection of human rights and respect for international law in Crimea;
4) Preparation of recommendations for government authorities and international organizations in the sphere of human rights;
5) Providing the presence of “human rights in the Crimea topics” in the information space.

The CHRG’s team consists of experts, human rights activists and journalists from different countries who are involved in monitoring and documenting human rights violations in Crimea, since February, 2014.

During preparation and spreading of the information the CHRG is guided by principles of objectivity, reliability and timeliness.
2. CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS

RIGHT TO LIBERTY AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON

SEARCHES AND DETENTIONS

On April 15, the Russian Federation FSB press office informed that searches had been carried out in Crimea and a man and a woman had been detained — they were accused of “collecting information for the Ukrainian intelligence services”. As to Mr. Konstantin Shiringa, a criminal case has been opened under RF Criminal Code Art. 276 (espionage) and he has been put in custody as pre-trial restriction measure. The woman (the name to be clarified) was accused under RF CC Art. 275 (high treason) and placed under house arrest because she parents minor children.¹ The RF FSB press office distributed a video through the media: the judgement for one of the detainees was being pronounced by Andrey Dolgopolov, a judge of the ‘Kievsky District Court of Simferopol’.²

On April 27 Liudmila Kapustina, a judge of ‘the Supreme Court of Republic of Crimea’ (‘SCRC’) upheld the decision of the ‘Kievsky District Court of Simferopol’ on imposing the pre-trial restriction for Konstantin Shiringa.³ According to the CHRG preliminary information, he was moved to Moscow, LEFORTOVO Detention Center.

POLITICALLY MOTIVATED CRIMINAL PROSECUTION

As of end of April 2020, 93 persons were deprived of liberty within a politically motivated criminal or religious persecution. The full list is published at the CHRG website.⁴

«CASE OF CRIMEAN MUSLIMS»

This case defendants are accused of membership in Muslim religious organizations or propaganda of activities of the organizations that are declared terrorist or extremist in the RF though they are not according to the Ukrainian laws.

In April the total number of Crimean residents deprived of liberty under the ‘Case of Crimean Muslims’ was 65 persons. 4 more people are under the movement restriction: 3 are subject to supervision, and are not allowed to leave the occupied territory, and 1 is on house arrest.

On April 8, Yelena Mikhalkova, judge of ‘the Supreme Court of the Republic of Crimea’ upheld the detention of Mr. Bilial Adilov until March 27, 2020.⁵ The previously defined period of detention had passed, and on March 23, the “SCRC” passed a judgement on extending the detention period until June 16 2020, so the procedure of consideration was just a formality.

¹ RF FSB / FSB of Russia Curbed Activities of Ukrainian Intelligence Service Secret Group http://www.fsb.ru/fsb/press/message/single.htm%21id%3D10439558%40fsbMessage.html
⁵ «SCRC» / List of cases to be heard on 8 April 2020. Case 22K-934/2020 https://vs--krm.sudrf.ru/modules.php?name=sud_delo&srv_num=1&H_date=08.04.2020
On April 8, FSB investigators accused the Muslims detained on March 11. **Amet Suleymanov, Seytumer Seytumerov, Osman Seytumerov and Rustem Seytmemetov** are charged under RF CC Article 205.5-2 (Participation in the activities of an organization declared terrorist in the Russian Federation).⑥

On April 13, the next hearing in the case of **Ernes Ametov, Marlen Asanov, Memet Belialov, Server Zekiryayev, Timur Ibragimov, Server Mustafayev, Seyran Saliyev and Eden Smailov** was held at the Southern Military Area Court (SMAC) in Rostov-na-Donu (RF).⑦ Lawyers informed that Rizvan Zubairov, a SMAC judge, extended their detention period until 13 August 2020.⑧

On April 16, Anatoliy Solin, a judge of the Military Court of Appeal of Vlasikha Town (Moscow Region, RF) upheld the sentence of **Enver Seytosmanov** (17 years in the maximum security penal colony).⑨ The lawyer informed that the hearing had been held via videoconference: Mr. Seytosmanov was in the Rostov-na-Donu detention center, the lawyer was in Simferopol, and the judge was in Vlasikha.⑩

On April 20, in Sochi (RF), judges of the recently created General Jurisdiction Third Court of Appeal (3rd GJCA), Yelena Udod, Yelena Kaporina and German Aleksandrov upheld the decision to keep **Enver Ametov, Tofik Abdulgaziyev, Remzi Bekirov** in custody until June 14, 2020.⑪ On April 23, judge Yelena Udod upheld the decision to keep **Mr. Shaban Umerov** in custody until June 14.⑫

The judges of this court, as well as other judicial instances of the Russian Federation, ignored the fact that Crimea is an occupied territory of Ukraine, and the Russian Federation is obliged to comply with international humanitarian law norms.

On April 24, a preliminary hearing of the case of **Enver Omerov, Riza Omerov and Ayder Dzhapparov** was held at the SMAC in Rostov-na-Donu. The case was examined by judge Roman Saprunov.⑬ According to the lawyer, the judge refused to admit that the accused should be covered by the IV Geneva Convention, passed a judgement that the Crimean residents should be moved from Simferopol to Rostov-na-Donu, and extended their detention period until October 15, 2020.⑭

On April 27 and 28, a preliminary hearing of the case of **Lenur Khalilov, Ruslan Nagayev, Ruslan Mesutov and Eldar Kantimirov** was held at the SMAC chaired by judge Roman Saprunov.⑮ Lawyers informed that on April 28, the judge extended the detention period until October 5, 2020 and passed a judgement on moving the Crimeans from Simferopol to Rostov-na-Donu.⑯

---

⑥ [https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1101550510212404](https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1101550510212404)
On April 29, the Kievsky District Court of Simferopol extended the detention period for Seytumer Seytumerov, Osman Seytumerov and Rustem Seytmemetov until August 9, 2020. There is no information on considering this case on the court’s website.

On April 30, the Kievsky District Court of Simferopol extended the period of house arrest for Amet Suleymanov until August 9, 2020. There is no information about the hearing on the court’s website.

**"UKRAINIAN SABOTEURS’ CASE"**

As of the end of April 2020, 14 people accused by the RF FSB of ‘preparing subversions, storing the arms and /or spying’ when detained, were in custody, and 1 person was on house arrest. These cases feature recorded facts of unlawful investigation methods, torturing to get confessions, violation of presumption of innocence, dissemination of ‘confession’ videos by the RF FSB via the Russian mass media.

On April 6 Larisa Likhacheva, a judge of ‘Armiansk Town Court’, sentenced Mr. Denis Kashuk, a Ukrainian national, to 3 years and 8 months in the general security regime penal colony on the charge of RF CC Articles 222, 222.1, 226.1 (unlawful storage, transportation and smuggling of arms and explosive devices). 19

On April 14, Natalya Konovalova, a Moscow City Court judge, upheld the decision to keeping Mr. Ivan Yatskin in custody until June 16, 2020. 20

On April 15, FSB officers detained two people in Crimea (Konstantin Shiringa and a woman), who were accused of espionage and high treason in favor of Ukraine (for more details, see “Searches and Detentions”).

On April 24, Margarita Kotova, a Lefortovo District Court of Moscow judge, extended a detention period for Ms. Galina Dovgopolova until July 27, 2020. 21

**PERSECUTION FOR CHARGING WITH BEING IN N.CHELEBDIJKHAN BATALLION**

As of the end of April, five Crimean are known to have been deprived of liberty under a charge of being in N.Chelebidjikhan battalion. The official reason for persecuting the accused in Crimea under RF CC Article 208-2 (Creation of unlawful military unit or participation in such unit) is that they failed to come voluntarily to the RF law enforcement bodies and declare their participation in the Crimean Tatar Noman Chelebidjikhan Volunteer Battalion.

On April 28 the consideration of the case of Nariman Mezhmedinov started in the ‘Chernomorsk District Court’. 22

17 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/videos/234271471226720/
18 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1118901531810635
20 Moscow City Court / Case 10-7156/2020 https://www.mos-gorsud.ru/mgs/services/cases/appeal-criminal/details/45016a4-1ae4-4e01-a891-16d2a6809d8
21 Lefortovo District Court / Case 3/2-0252/2020 https://www.mos-gorsud.ru/rs/lefortovskij/services/cases/criminal-materials/details/fh2ef1d1-21d1-4871-96f1-a8c0db6dfdaec
22 «Chernomorsk District Court» / List of cases to be heard on 28 April 2020, Case 1-44/2020 https://chernomorsky-krm.sudrf.ru/modules.php?name=sud_delo&srv_num=1&H_date=28.04.2020
OLEG PRIKHOD’KO’S CASE

The Southern Military Area Court postponed, upon the lawyer’s petition, the consideration of the case of Ukrainian activist Oleh Prikhod’ko due to COVID-19 epidemic.  

CONFINEMENT CONDITIONS IN DETENTION FACILITIES

On April 2, Mr. Sergey Filatov, a defendant of ‘Case of Jehovah’s Witnesses’, told his wife that there were 14 people in the 12 sleeping places’ cell in the Simferopol Detention Center where he was being held, so they had to sleep in turn.

On April 5, Mrs. Fatma Ismailova, the spouse of Mr. Rustem Ismailov, a ‘Case of Crimean Muslims’ defendant, informed that she had got no information of her husband being since February 24, 2020. In the latest letter, he wrote that he was in the hospital at Detention Center no 1 of the Ufa City. But she has not been informed yet which colony he was sent to.

On April 30, the lawyer visited Mr. Ernes Ametov (“Case of Crimean Muslims”) at the detention center # 1 (FKU GUFSIN of Russia for the Rostov Region (Rostov-na-Donu), where at least 14 Crimean residents deprived of their liberty in politically motivated criminal cases, were kept. According to the lawyer, due to COVID-19 “quarantine” measures, lawyers in the pre-trial detention center were forbidden to communicate with clients in individual rooms, they had to communicate in the relatives meeting room — through glass and by phone. Thus, confidential communication and signing of documents by clients is not possible. Some lawyers can’t see their clients because there is not enough space. Mr. Ametov said that the food package submission was very restricted, for instance, it was forbidden to bring dairy products, that made a weak health even worse.

---

23 Krym.Realii / Court in Russia Postponed Session on Case of Oleh Prykhod’ko, a pro-Ukrainian activist from Crimea  

24 Krym.Realii / «We Have To Sleep In Turn»: Jehovah’s Witness’ Sentenced in Crimea Described the Detention Center Conditions  

25 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1099188240448631

26 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/photos/a.416800078687454/1120440831656705/?type=3&theater
FREEDOM OF THOUGHT, CONSCIENCE AND RELIGION

On April 1, the “prosecutor” of Alushta opened administrative proceedings against Mr. Yusuf Ashirov, the imam of the “Alushta” religious community, for “illegal missionary activity” under Article 5.26-4 of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation (RF CoAO) (Illegal missionary activity). The reason for this was holding Friday prayers, 27, a traditional rite for Muslims.

On April 22, it became known that Mr. Diliaver Khalilov, the imam of the Sovetsky District of Crimea, had been called up to the “Prosecutor’s Office’, where he had been charged of RF CoAO Article 20.2-2 (organization of an unauthorized public event) for holding Friday prayers. The lawyer said that initially there had been an attempt to convict the imam under RF CoAO Article 5.26-4, but then the qualification was changed. The ‘Prosecutor’s Office’ stated that the imam had not re-registered the mosque building under Russian laws after 2014, so the mosque building was a sports complex. 28 On April 29, Igor Brazhnik, a judge of ‘Sovetsky District Court’, awarded fining Mr. Khalilov 29 of RUR30,000. 30

In April the CHRG documented 3 new administrative procedures against the religious organizations of Crimea under RF CoAO Article 5.26-3. On April 21 judge Artem Cherkashyn fined the Seventh-Day Adventist Church in Bakhchisaray District of RUR30,000, 31, on April 22 judge Ullubiy Isayev fined the “Light to World” Church of the Evangelical Christians from Yalta of RUR30,000. 32 The case of the ‘Jewish Religious Community of Simferopol City’ is still being considered. 33

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

On April 1 the RF President V.Putin signed Law # 100FZ, 34, that enacted new criminal articles and supplemented the valid norms. The RF CC was supplemented with Articles 207.1 and 207.2 ‘The public dissemination of misleading information about circumstances that pose a threat to the life and safety of people’ that classified the dissemination of ‘misleading information disguised as trustworthy’ on the safety measures taken in the context of COVID-19 pandemic as a criminal act. RF CoAO Article 13.15 was supplemented with parts 10 and 11 imposing a punishment for ‘disseminating misleading information about circumstances that pose a threat to the life and safety of people’ in the mass media or internet. Dissemination of ‘misleading information disguised as trustworthy’ on the people safety measures taken is to be punished, too. The inconsistency of this wording, the lack of legal certainty and a wide range of crime subjects create conditions for abuse of authority by police officers regarding the persons and organizations covering the COVID-19 pandemic situation in Crimea.

28 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1112850669062386
30 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1118300748537380
34 http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/0001202004010037?index=6&rangeSize=1
FREEDOM OF ASSEMBLY AND ASSOCIATION

On April 2, the Russian policemen delivered a warning note on inadmissibility of participating in unauthorized events to activist Nariman Temirkaliyev 35 and journalist Nuri Abdurashitov. 36

On April 4, similar warning notes were handed by the police to Nariman Dzhabbarov, Nariman Nedziyev, Emin Belialov, and Eskender Lumanov, 37 and on April 9 — to Rustem Mennanov. 38

On April 9, a man who introduced himself as a criminal investigator came to the house of Mr. Marlen Asanov, a ‘Case of Crimean Muslims’ defendant, who had been deprived of liberty since October 2017. Despite this, the policeman intended to read Mr. Asanov a warning on inadmissibility of participating in unauthorized events since he seemed to have been noticed somewhere and had to be held a preventive conversation with. 39

On April 10, Anastasiya Shapoval, a judge of ‘Feodosiya Town Court’, fined activist Larisa Kurashkina of RUR10,000 for organizing an “unauthorized” event in support of Taigan Lion Park in December 2019. 40

On April 16, a Russian policeman came to activist Alexander Gavrikov and demanded him to sign a document that he would not participate in peaceful assemblies in April-May 2020. 41

On April 17, Kulamet Ibraimov, Ibragim Ibraimov, Nuri Abdurashitov (repeatedly) and Emin Rustemov were known to have been handed warning notes. 42

On April 18, Mr. Nariman Dzelii published a warning note handed by the Russian police to Mr. Enver Emirsanov. 43 Mr. Zair Smedlyaev, Head of the Kurultay of the Crimean Tatar People Central Election Commission, published the warning he had received. 44 On April 21, Ms. Elmaz Akimova informed that she had been also handed a warning, 45 and on April 29, a similar warning was handed to Mr. Tair Ibraimov. 46

On April 30, the Russian policemen warned relatives of the ‘Case of Crimean Muslims’ defendants: Mr. Reshat Emiruseinov, father of Rustem Emiruseinov, 47 and Mrs. Meriem Kuku, wife of Emir-Usein Kuku — of responsibility for participating in unauthorized public events. The warning note was also handed to lawyer Ruslan Abdurashitov 49

Due to COVID-19 pandemic, the authorities de facto enforced the ‘high alert regime’ in Crimea that imposed a ban on the public events.

35 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1096835377350584
36 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/photos/a.416800079687454/1097236527310469/
37 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1098045090562946
39 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/photos/a.416800079687454/110205199349588
40 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1108678356166286
41 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1109000172800771
42 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/photos/a.416800079687454/1110035041897284
43 https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/1110306501770138
FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT

After the RF nationals were prohibited to leave Russia, Russian border guards continue to reject the Crimeans to leave to the Ukraine controlled territory, referring to their RF national passports “automatically” issued on the peninsula. For instance, on April 5, a Ukrainian national with cancer disease was rejected by the RF FSB border department staff to leave Crimea for treatment in Kyiv who referred to the fact that she had obtained a Russian passport and, in their opinion, could be treated at the place of registration on the peninsula. 50

On April 17 Soviet dissident Oleg Sofianik informed that the Russian border guards had rejected him to leave Crimea with a Ukrainian national passport referring to his holding a RF passport. 51 On April 27 he was again rejected leaving via DZHANKOY Russian checkpoint. 52

Since April 3, in Crimea, a number of bans on leaving the house for local residents were introduced as part of the “high alert” regime. As a result, you may leave your place of residence only if there is a threat to life and health, a need to buy food, to walk your pets, to take out the garbage, to visit people who need appropriate care, or if you have a certificate from the employer about official purposes of moving around the city. There are also bans on minors staying unaccompanied by parents in public places and leaving the place of residence by people over the age of 65 or people with certain diseases. Failure to comply with such restrictions may cause administrative liability (fines). On April 20 the ‘head’ of Crimea signed Edict 113-U, 53, that cancelled such restrictions for members of paramilitary units — ‘Kazak associations’.

On April 13, Edict of “Governor of the City of Sevastopol” No. 30-UG 54 on additional restrictive measures in the city was signed. Entering and leaving the city is carried out only through 24-hour checkpoints, subject to verification of residence registration or actual residence in Sevastopol. The checkpoints are operated by the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Russian Guard, and the FSB of the Russian Federation. On April 30, Edict No. 37-UG 55 was issued in Sevastopol regulating the issuance of QR passes through the “Portal of Government Authorities” to move around the city.

For more information about the restrictions in Crimea due to the COVID-19 pandemic, see dedicated reviews on the CHRG website. 56

50 CHRG / A Crimean Woman Who Needed Cancer Treatment Was Not Allowed By Russian Border Guards To Go From Crimea To Kyiv https://crimeahrg.org/ru/krymchanku-nuzhdayushuyusya-v-lechenii-onkologii-rossijskie-pogranichniki-ne-propustili-iz-kryma-v-kiev/
54 https://sev.gov.ru/docs/257/102657/
55 https://sev.gov.ru/docs/257/103528/
3. VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW

GENEVA CONVENTION (IV) RELATIVE TO THE PROTECTION OF CIVILIAN PERSONS IN TIME OF WAR

CONSCRIPTION OF PERSONS LIVING IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORY INTO ARMED FORCES OF OCCUPYING POWER AND PROPAGANDA OF JOINING VOLUNTARILY THE ARMED FORCES

On April 1, the Russian authorities started the 11th draft campaign in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol. According to the press office of the Southern Military Area of the Russian Federation, the Russian authorities plan to draft about 3,300 men in the occupied territory of Ukraine.  

Due to COVID-19 pandemic, the work of draft commissions was suspended in April (personal reception of people and medical examinations). The “Military Commissioner of the Republic of Crimea” Oleg Yermilov announced that the preliminary date for sending the first group of draftees from Crimea was postponed till May 20, 2020. On April 29, the Minister of Defense of the Russian Federation announced that the draft commissions would start working on May 12, and sending draftees to the RF Armed Forces would start on May 20.  

In April 2020 the CHRG documented 8 new criminal cases of Crimean residents under RF CC Article 328 (evading the military service in the Russian Federation Armed Forces): 2 in the ‘Kirovsky District Court’, 2 in the ‘Nizhnegorskiy District Court’, 2 in the ‘Leninsky District Court of Sevastopol’, 1 in the ‘Dzhankoy Town Court’ and 1 in the ‘Kerch Town Court’. One verdict was rendered in the ‘Leninsky District Court of Sevastopol’ for the criminal case opened earlier.  

Totally, as of the end of April 2020 the CHRG documented 101 criminal cases initiated for evading the RF Army military service, that were sent to the Crimean ‘courts’ for considering, with verdicts delivered for 90 of them and 11 being still under consideration.

THE REVIEW WAS PREPARED BY:

Olga Skrypnyk, coordinator for the Crimean Human Rights Group; Oleksandr Siedov, analyst for the Crimean Human Rights Group.

---

57 RF Ministry of Defence / Spring 2020 Draft Started in Crimea and Sevastopol https://function.mil.ru/news_page/country/more.htm?id=12285149@ogNews
59 KrymInform / First Group of Crimean Draftees To Leave Crimea on May 20 http://www.c-inform.info/news/id/85023
60 Zvezda / Recruits To Be Sent To Compulsory Military Service Since May 20 https://tvzvezda.ru/news/forces/content/202004291238-80e72.html
63 «Leninsky District Court of Sevastopol» / Cases 1-169/2020, 1-175/2020 https://leninskiy--sev.sudrf.ru
64 «Kerch Town Court» / Case 1-253/2020 http://kerch.krm.sudrf.ru/
65 «Dzhankoy Town Court» / Case 1-176/2020 http://dzhankoi.krm.sudrf.ru/
66 «Leninsky District Court of Sevastopol» / Case 1-91/2020 https://leninskiy--sev.sudrf.ru