

CRIMEAN HUMAN RIGHTS GROUP

e-mail: crimeahrg@gmail.com

website: crimeahrg.org

THE VICTIMS OF ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCE IN CRIMEA AS A RESULT OF THE ILLEGAL ESTABLISHMENT OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION CONTROL (2014 - 2016)

The report prepared by the Crimean Human Rights Group as of June 2016

Follow the http://crimeahrg.org/category/monitor, to read monthly monitoring reviews of the Crimean Human Rights Group

Follow the http://crimeahrg.org/category/analytic, to read thematic reviews and articles of the Crimean Human Rights Group

The Crimean Human Rights Group (CHRG) is the NGO of the Crimean human rights defenders and journalists, aimed at promoting the observance and protection of human rights in Crimea by attracting wide attention to problems of human rights and international humanitarian law in the territory of the Crimean peninsula, and the search for and development of mechanisms for the protection of human rights in Crimea.

The CHRG is guided by principles of objectivity, reliability and timeliness while preparing and spreading information. The CHRG's team consists of experts, human rights activists and journalists from different countries who are involved in monitoring and documenting human rights violations in Crimea, since February, 2014. CHRG focuses on human rights violations in connection with the illegal actions of the Russian Federation in Crimea.



During the preparation of the review CHRG follows the next definition that is regulated by the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance:

"enforced disappearance" is considered to be the arrest, detention, abduction or any other form of deprivation of liberty by agents of the State or by persons or groups of persons acting with the authorization, support or acquiescence of the State, followed by a refusal to acknowledge the deprivation of liberty or by concealment of the fate or whereabouts of the disappeared person, which place such a person outside the protection of the law.

According to the Crimean Human Rights Group 9 people became victims of enforced disappearances among civilians as a result of the illegal establishment of the Russian Federation control in Crimea. CHRG considers victims of disappearances, which have next elements:

Politically motivated abductions in connection with the social activities or an ethnic / religious affiliation of the vanished person;

■ The involvement of representatives of the de facto authorities or members of paramilitary groups, controlled by the de facto authority, in the enforced disappearance;

■ The lack of effective investigation by the de facto authorities of Crimea.

In addition, the CHRG tracks information about other cases of disappearance, which may have signs of enforced disappearance, but there are no sufficient reason to consider them as such at the moment.

It is important to note that members of paramilitary formations, in the first place, the so-called «Crimean self-defence» were involved in the majority of enforced disappearances in 2014. «Crimean self-defense» is one of the main systemic violations of human rights in Crimea. «Crimean self-defense» has emerged as an illegal armed group on February 20, 2014 and has been extensively involved in the storming of the Ukrainian military units, the squad of assemblies in support of the «Maidan» and territorial integrity of Ukraine, the capture of administrative buildings.

The «self-defense» included former personnel of the special force «Bercut» of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine, the representatives of sports clubs and associations, as well as criminal organizations, including Russian citizens and local residents. In March there were numerous contacts of the «Crimean self-defense» with the Russian servicemen in joint actions. There is evidence of the involvement of representatives of the «Crimean self-defense» in the most serious violations of human rights, namely, the abduction and murder of *Reshat Ametov* (the body was found on March 15); the abduction and torture of more than 20 Ukrainian activists (among them *Andrey Schekun, Anatoliy Kovalskiy* and others).

After March 18, the «Crimean self-defense» was not disbanded, vice versa — the process of its establishment as a force structure to support the Crimean government (especially of S.Aksenov) and suppress any attempts to oppose the new government commenced. On June 11, the Crimean defacto authorities adopted a Law On the People's Militia — the people's guard of the Republic of Crimea. This Law has put the «Crimean self-defense» under the control of the Head of Crimea S. Aksenov and of the Council of Ministers of Crimea, and assigned to the paramilitary formation the status of people's guards.¹

Also there is a particularity of law enforcement officials, that have been created by the de facto authorities in Crimea after the Crimean occupation, that the employees are those individuals who have

¹ Legalization of «CRIMEAN SELF-DEFENSE», web-site of the Crimean Human Rights Group: http://crimeahrg.org/en/legalization-of-crimean-self-defense/

supported the illegal actions of Russia in Crimea, and many of them contributed to the occupation of Ukrainian military units and office buildings by the Russian military or paramilitary units during February and March, 2014.

In addition, many senior positions in the Crimean force authorities since 2014 are taken by officials, who are citizens of Russia and who were transferred to Crimea. For example, Victor Palagin is the head of the Federal Security Service of Russia in Crimea and Sevastopol. Previously, from 2008 to 2013 he was a head of the Federal Security Service of Russia in the Republic of Bashkortostan. In Bashkiria Victor Palagin was known for having initiated a series of criminal cases regarding extremist crimes, defendants in which were participants of religious and national non-governmental organizations. Palagin reported that other Federal Security Service of Russia colleagues were transferred with him in Crimea.

Thus, this situation creates a risk of biased investigation or sabotaging of the investigations regarding the disappearances, the victims of which are individuals who belong to groups that are opposed to the annexation of Crimea (Ukrainian and Crimean Tatars, the protesters on Independence Square in Kiev).

It is necessary to note that Ukrainian legislation accredits authorizes of the Prosecutor's Office and the police authorities of Ukraine to make the appropriate legal proceedings on the fact of abduction or disappearances of citizens of Ukraine in Crimea. Furthermore, for the purpose of recording the violations of human rights in Crimea and investigation of crimes that were committed by the de facto authorities in Crimea, the individual law enforcement agencies were created (restored) in Ukraine: The Prosecutor's Office of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea (Kiev), the main national police headquarters in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol (Odessa), the Office of the security Service of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol (Kherson). In this regard, the CHRG also monitors the activities of Ukrainian law enforcement agencies in matters of recording and investigation of human rights violations in Crimea.





Reshat Ametov

Date of Birth: 01/24/1975

Occupation: activist

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Crimean Tatar Disappearance date: March 03, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Simferopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

He was abducted by men in camouflage uniforms in the centre of Simferopol on 3 March, 2014 during a single picket against the occupation of Crimea by Russia on Lenin Square next to the Crimean Council of Ministers building. His body with signs of torture was found in the Zemlyanichnoe village of Belogorsk district. Handcuffs were found next to the body and the head of the killed was bound up with tape. The cause of death — a penetrating stab wound to the eye with a sharp object.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

The Investigative Committee of the Investigation Department of Russia in Crimea has opened a criminal case under part 1 of article 105 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation — «Murder».

On 4 November, 2014 a criminal investigation regarding the murder of Reshat Ametov been suspended, the official reason: "The person liable to be charged, is not determined". Members of the "Crimean self-defence", which are involved in the abduction of Ametov are determined, but are considered as witnesses in the case.

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

In the Kherson region of Ukraine (the region that borders on Crimea) pre-trial investigation regarding the killing of Reshat Ametov is taking place on the grounds of a criminal offense under the Part 1 of Article 115 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «premeditated murder».

- 1. The Brief Reviews of Crimean Field Mission in April, May, June 2014: http://cfmission.crimeahr.org/en/category/
- 2. The Crimean Human Rights Group, the Review of the Situation with Human Rights in Crimea in October 2015: http://crimeahrg.org/en/review-of-the-situation-with-human-rights-in-crimea-in-october-2015/
- 3. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.1. The First Victims of the Occupation: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear_Book_ENG_v04.indd_.pdf
- 4. The Video recording of Reshat Ametov's abduction on March 3, 2014, in the central square of Simferopol: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2gwhzl7dbj0



Timur Shaimardanov

Date of Birth: 09/13/1980

Occupation: activist of the public initiative «Ukrainian People's House», participated in humanitarian assistance to Ukrainian military

in Crimea in March 2014

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Kazan Tatar Disappearance date: May 26, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Simferopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

On 25 May, 2014 the activist reported to his colleagues in the social activities regarding the disappearance of Leonid Korzh (who later returned home). On 26 May, 2014 Shaimardanov left the house and never returned home. The connection with him was lost on the same day. Witnesses and relatives informed about the involvement of members of the «Crimean self-defence» in the abduction of activist.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

Russia's Investigative Committee opened a criminal case under the Article 105 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation — «Murder». In November 2015 the lawyer reported that the case is suspended in Crimea.

The investigator in the case denied the access to the case file for the lawyer. The lawyer appealed against this refusal of the investigator and did not receive a response to his application for a long time.

Witnesses reported that the investigation in the case of the abduction of Timur Shaimardanov is considering versions of extinction due to commercial activity or hiss voluntary departure from Crimea, but does not consider the version of the abduction because of his social activities and involvement of the persons from the «Crimean self-defence».

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

In connection with the abduction of Timur Shaimardanov a criminal case under the Article 146 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «Illegal imprisonment or kidnapping», which is being investigated by the Main Department of the Interior Ministry of Ukraine in the Kherson region was opened. Later, the case was transferred to the General Office of the National Police in the Kherson region.

Representatives of the relatives of Timur Shaimardanov filed a complaint to the ECHR against Russia and Ukraine due to the inaction of law enforcement agencies in the investigation of this fact.

- 1. The Brief Reviews of Crimean Field Mission in May 2014: http://cfmission.crimeahr.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/otchet_krymskoy_polevoy_missii-may_2014.pdf
- 2. Information about Timur Shaimardanov on the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation website in the «Missing» section: http://crim.sledcom.ru/attention/missing_persons/item/873128/
- 3. Information about Timur Shaimardanov on the Interior Ministry of Ukraine website in the «Disappeared Citizens» section: http://wanted.mvs.gov.ua/searchbezvesti/
- 4. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2. Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear Book ENG v04.indd .pdf





Seyran Zinedinov

Date of Birth: 07/04/1981

Occupation: Activist of «Ukrainian People's House» public initiative,

the participant of actions against Russia's actions in Crimea

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Crimean Tatar

Disappearance date: May 30, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Simferopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

Seyran Zinedinov was engaged in the search for the missing colleague in social activities Timur Shaimardanov on 26 May. In the evening on 30 May, 2014 Seyran Zinedinov met with the wife of Shaimardanov, but after the meeting did not return home. After the disappearance the signal of his mobile phone was detected next to the "Dolphin" pensionate near the town of Yevpatoria. In addition, relatives of Seyran Zinetdinov reported about the existence of a video from the surveillance camera, which is detected as the activist was putted in the car against his will. Witnesses also reported about the involvement of members of the "Crimean self-defence" in the abduction.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

Russia's Investigative Committee opened a criminal case under the Article 105 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Fedreation — «Murder». In November 2015 the lawyer reported that the case is suspended in Crimea.

In the case of the abduction of Seyran Zinedinov the investigation considering versions of disappearance due to commercial activity or voluntary departure from the Crimea, but does not consider the version of the abduction because of social activities and involvement of persons from the «Crimean self-defence», as reported by witnesses.

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

In connection with the abduction Seyran Zinedinov a criminal case under the Article 146 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «Illegal imprisonment or kidnapping», which is being investigated by the Main Department of the Interior Ministry of Ukraine in the Kherson region was opened. Later, the case was transferred to the General Office of the National Police in the Kherson region.

However, on the site of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine Zinedinov listed as missing not in Crimea, but in the territory of the antiterrorist operation (Luhansk and Donetsk region of Ukraine)

Representatives of Zinedinov relatives filed a complaint to the ECHR against Russia and Ukraine due to the inaction of law enforcement agencies in the investigation of this fact.

- 1. The Brief Reviews of Crimean Field Mission in May 2014: http://cfmission.crimeahr.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/otchet_krymskoy_polevoy_missii-may_2014.pdf
- 2. Information about Seyran Zinedinov on the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation website in the «Missing» section: http://crim.sledcom.ru/attention/missing_persons/item/873129/
- 3. Information about Seyran Zinedinov on the Interior Ministry of Ukraine website in the «Disappeared Citizens» section: http://wanted.mvs.gov.ua/searchbezvesti/
- 4. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear Book ENG v04.indd pdf



Vasiliy Chernysh

Date of Birth: 02/01/1978

Occupation: Activist of «automaidan». Participated in the search of abducted activists in Crimea and was an employee of Security Service of Ukraine in Sevastopol earlier.

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Ukrainian Disappearance date: March 15, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Sevastopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

The last time Vasiliy Chernysh got in touch with the relatives was on 15 March, 2014. Ever since then his location is not known. The activist of «automaidan» Alexey Gritsenko reported that they were able to find out that Chernysh was taken from his apartment and taken away in an unknown direction by police officers.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea	Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine
De facto authorities in Crimea are not conducting an investigation regarding the disappearance of Vasiliy Chernysh. He is not listed on the website of the Investigative Committee of Russia in Crimea in the «Missing» section.	Upon the disappearance of Vasiliy Chernysh information was included in the National Register of Pre-Trial Investigations under №121014100010004863 by the Main Department of Internal Affairs of Ukraine in Kiev on 18 June, 2014.
	However, on the site of MIA of Ukraine in the «Missing Citizens» section it is stated that Chernysh disappeared not in Crimea but in Donetsk, Donetsk region of Ukraine.

- 1. The Crimean Human Rights Group, the Review of the Situation with Human Rights in Crimea in July-August 2015: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Crimean Human Rights Group July August 2015 ENG.pdf
- 2. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear Book ENG v04.indd pdf
- 3. Crimea: Ukrainian identity banned. Analytical report on politically motivated persecution and discrimination on the ground of pro-Ukrainian opinion. Editor: Olga Skrypnyk Kyiv, 2016. http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Crimea-Ukrainian-identity-banned_EN_CHRG.pdf
- 4. Information about Vasiliy Chernysh on the Interior Ministry of Ukraine website in the «Disappeared Citizens» section: http://wanted.mvs.gov.ua/searchbezvesti/





Ivan Bondarec

Date of Birth: 07/31/1990

Occupation: the participant of the 40th sotnia of Maidan-selfde-

fence. Protester on Independence Square in Kiev.

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Ukrainian Disappearance date: March 07, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Simferopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

Upon arrival in Simferopol Ivan Bondarec and his public colleague Valeriy Vashchuk called their relatives and said that they were detained by the police in Simferopol. After that, they reported that they were released, and they are going to the meeting of the Ukrainian movement with colleagues. Since then communication with them was lost, and so far nothing is known about their location.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine De facto authorities in Crimea are not conducting Upon the disappearance of Ivan Bondarec Prosan investigation regarding the disappearance of ecutor's Office of the Autonomous Republic of Ivan Bondarec. Crimea (Kiev) opened criminal proceedings under the Part 1 of Article 115 of the Criminal Code of He is not listed on the website of the Investigative Ukraine - «deliberate murder». Committee of Russia in Crimea in the «Missing» section. Also regarding the disappearance of I. Bondarec Rovno Regional Office of the Ministry of Internal Affairs in Rovno region filled in the information in National Register of Pre-Trial Investigations №120141800010001927 on 9 April, 2014. However, at present the information about the disappearance of Bondarec is missing on the website of MIA of Ukraine in the «Disappeared Citizens» section.

- 1. The Crimean Human Rights Group, the Review of the Situation with Human Rights in Crimea in July-August 2015: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Crimean_Human_Rights_Group_July_August_2015_ENG.pdf
- 2. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear_Book_ENG_v04.indd_.pdf
- 3. Crimea: Ukrainian identity banned. Analytical report on politically motivated persecution and discrimination on the ground of pro-Ukrainian opinion. Editor: Olga Skrypnyk Kyiv, 2016. http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Crimea-Ukrainian-identity-banned_EN_CHRG.pdf



Valery Vashchuk

Date of Birth: 12/29/1985

Occupation: the participant of the 40th sotnia of Maidan-selfdefence.

Protester on Independence Square in Kiev.

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Ukrainian Disappearance date: March 07, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Simferopol

Circumstances of the disappearance:

On arrival at the Simferopol Valery Vashchuk and his public colleague Ivan Bondarec called their relatives and said that they were detained by the police in Simferopol. After that, they reported that they were released, and they are going to the meeting with their colleagues to the Ukrainian movement. Since then communication with them was lost, and so far nothing is known about their location.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

De facto authorities in Crimea are not conducting an investigation regarding the disappearance of Ivan Bondarec.

He is not listed on the website of the Investigative Committee of Russia in Crimea in the «Missing» section.

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

On 2 April, 2014 Ostroh Regional Office of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine in Rovno region initiated a pre-trial investigation regarding the disappearance of Valeriy Vashchuk Nº12014180170000136 in criminal proceedings on the grounds of the Part 1 of Article 115 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «deliberate murder».

However, the case files were sent to the Simferopol State Interior Ministry of Ukraine in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea in Simferopol on 11 April, 2014. During this period the Ukrainian authorities have not acted on the territory of Crimea.

Valeriy Vashchuk is listed on the website of MIA of Ukraine in the "Disappeared Citizens" section as missing on the territory of Crimea.

- 1. The Crimean Human Rights Group, the Review of the Situation with Human Rights in Crimea in July-August 2015: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Crimean_Human_Rights_Group_July_August_2015_ENG.pdf
- 2. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear_Book_ENG_v04.indd_.pdf
- 3. Crimea: Ukrainian identity banned. Analytical report on politically motivated persecution and discrimination on the ground of pro-Ukrainian opinion. Editor: Olga Skrypnyk Kyiv, 2016. http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Crimea-Ukrainian-identity-banned_EN_CHRG.pdf
- 4. Information about Valeriy Vashchuk on the Interior Ministry of Ukraine website in the «Disappeared Citizens» section: http://wanted.mvs.gov.ua/searchbezvesti/





Islyam Dzhepparov

Date of Birth: 11/13/1995

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Crimean Tatar Disappearance date: September 27, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Belogorsk

The circumstances of the disappearance:

According to witnesses, two masked men dressed in black uniforms, allegedly members of the «Crimean self-defence» searched Islyam Dzhepparov and Dzhavdet Islyamov and then forcibly put them in the blue Volkswagen Transporter minivan with tinted windows (registered sign 755, region 82) and taken in the direction of Feodosia. Islyam Dzhepparov is the son of the Crimean Tatar activist Abdureshit Dzhepparov.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

Russian Investigative Committee opened a criminal case on the grounds of an offense under subsection «A, G» part 2 article 126 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation — «abduction of a person by a group of persons with prior agreement in respect of two or more persons».

Results of the investigation are unknown.

Despite signs of an enforced disappearance, the investigation considers the version of the voluntary departure from Crimea or departure to Syria, ostensibly to participate in armed hostilities.

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

Prosecutor General of Ukraine opened criminal proceedings in connection with the abduction of Islyam Dzhepparov on the grounds of a criminal offense under the Part 2 of Article 146 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «unlawful deprivation of liberty, or kidnapping, committed against two or more persons with prior agreement by a group of persons».

However, there is no information about the disappearance on the site of Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine.

- 1. The Brief Reviews of Crimean Field Mission in September 2014: http://cfmission.crimeahr.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/crimea_field_mission_septmber_2014_report_eng.pdf
- 2. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear Book ENG v04.indd ,pdf
- 3. Information about Islyam Dzhepparov on the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation website in the "Missing" section: http://crim.sledcom.ru/attention/missing persons/item/873126/



Islyamov Dzhavdet Serverovich

Date of Birth: 04/30/1991

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Crimean Tatar Disappearance date: September 27, 2014

Settlement in which he was seen before disappearing: Belogorsk

The circumstances of the disappearance:

According to witnesses, two masked men dressed in black uniforms, allegedly members of the «Crimean self-defence» searched Dzhavdet Islyamov and Islyam Dzhepparov and then forcibly put them in a blue Volkswagen Transporter minivan with tinted windows (registered sign 755, region 82) and taken them in the direction of Feodosia.

Investigation:

De facto authorities in Crimea

Russian Investigative Committee opened a criminal case on the grounds of an offense under subsection «A, G» part 2 article 126 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation — «abduction of a person, a group of persons with prior agreement in respect of two or more persons».

Results of the investigation are unknown.

Despite signs of an enforced disappearance, the investigation considers the version of the voluntary departure from Crimea or departure to Syria, ostensibly to participate in armed hostilities.

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine

Prosecutor General of Ukraine opened criminal proceedings in connection with the abduction of Dzhavdet Islyamov on the grounds of a criminal offense under the Part 2 of Article 146 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine — «unlawful deprivation of liberty, or kidnapping, committed against two or more persons with prior agreement by a group of persons».

However, there is no information about the disappearance on the site of Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine.

- 1. The Brief Reviews of Crimean Field Mission in September 2014: http://cfmission.crimeahr.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/crimea_field_mission_septmber_2014_report_eng.pdf
- 2. The Peninsula of Fear: Chronicle of Occupation and Violation of Human Rights in Crimea / Under the general editorship of O. Skrypnyk and T. Pechonchyk. Second edition, revised and corrected, Kyiv, 2016 / Point 4.2.

 Abductions and Tortures of Activists During the Occupation of Crimea: http://crimeahrg.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/PeninsulaFear Book ENG v04.indd ,pdf
- 3. Information about Dzhavdet Islyamov on the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation website in the «Missing» section: http://crim.sledcom.ru/attention/missing_persons/item/873126/





Erwin Ibragimov

Date of Birth: 07/17/1985

Occupation: from 10.01.2011 was a chief specialist of international relations of Bakhchisaray district administration in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, Bakhchisaray. He was the deputy of the 6th convocation of the City Council.

Ethnic / religious affiliation: Crimean Tatar

Disappearance date: May 24, 2016

Settlement in which he was seen: Bakhchisaray

Circumstances of the disappearance:

Unidentified persons in the Russia traffic police uniform stopped a passing by car of Ibragimov in Bakhchisarai near the house on the 9 Mira street. After that he was forcibly putted in the car and drove away in an unknown direction. On 1 June near the "Arpat" bar in Bakhchisarai, passport and work record book of the kidnapped Ibragimov were found.

Investigation:

Law enforcement bodies of Ukraine De facto authorities in Crimea Main Investigation Department of the Investigative Prosecutor's Office of Crimea (Kiev) has opened Committee of Russia in Crimea opened a criminal criminal proceedings on the fact of kidnapping of case under subsection «A, B» part 2, Article 126 Ibragimov under part 1 article 115 of the Criminal of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation -Code of Ukraine - «deliberate murder». «Abduction». Local community representatives have repeatedly carried out actions with the requirement to provide information about the investigation and the involvement of police officers in the abduction. However, there is no new information on the case.

- 1. Video from the place of abduction of Erwin Ibragimov: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FW8bqgsBFaQ
- 2. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YZZh4zFaWKY
- 3. Information about Erwin Ibragimov on the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation website in the «Missing» section: http://crim.sledcom.ru/news/item/1045425/
- 4. Notice regarding the beginning of the criminal procedure by the prosecutor's office of Crimea (Kiev): http://ark.gp.gov.ua/ua/news.html? m=publications& t=rec&id=184163
- 5. The Crimean Human Rights Group, the Review of the Situation with Human Rights in Crimea in May 2016: http://crimeahrg.org/en/category/monitor-2/



OTHER CASES OF DISAPPEARANCES WITH POSSIBLE SIGNS OF ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCES:

Edem Asanov, born in 1989, disappeared on his way to work on 29 September, 2014 in the town of Saki. According to his sister Asanova Feride, he left his house in Saki at 8:30 a.m. to take a bus to Yalta, where he worked as a lifeguard at the sanatorium. On 6 October Asanov was found hanged in a abundant building in Yevpatoria. Suicide note was found with him. Relatives insist that the death of Eden Asanov is not connected with the political processes that are taking place in Crimea.

At the same time, the information was spread that the namesake of E. Asanov has been specified in the request of 22 September regarding the extending the arrest for Ukrainian film director Oleg Sentsov regarding the so-called «case of the Crimean terrorists». The document, signed by the senior investigator for particularly important cases of the Investigative Department of the FSB of the Russian Federation, states that Major of Justice Artem Burdin, said: «The specified terrorist community at various times included Asanov E.N., Afanasiev G.S., ..., ..., Kol'chenko A.A.,, Chirniy A.V. and other unidentified persons». This information appeared about a week before the disappearance of E. Asanov. Some experts expressed the view that these circumstances make it impossible to say with certainty about the non-violent nature of E. Asanov death.

Mukhtar Arislanov, born in 1970, is a Crimean Tatar who worked as a physical education teacher at the school in Simferopol district. On 27 August, 2015 went out of the house to buy some products at the «Zaleski» market in Simferopol, and so far has not returned. According to Arislanov sister, a witness saw two men in police uniform that were guiding Arislanov. The silver minivan came down from the side of storey buildings. Arislanov was putted in the bus and drove off in the direction of the city. The Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation opened a criminal case on the grounds of an offense under the Part 1, Article 105 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (murder). There is no information about the disappearance on the site of Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine.

Separately, it must be said about the fact of the disappearance of Fedor Kostenko.

On 3 March, 2015 it became known about the disappearance of Fedor Kostenko who is the father of Ukrainian political prisoner Alexander Kostenko (who is located in prison camp in Kirovo-Chipetsk in Russian). Before his disappearance, Fedor Kostenko came from Crimea to Kiev to communicate with the media on the case of his son. However, he found out about the new search of his apartment in Simferopol and decided to return to Crimea. The last time he got in touch via mobile phone from Kiev, and then there was no connection with him. According to the State Border Service of Ukraine, Fedor Kostenko left the territory of Crimea on 1 March 2015. There is no information about the fact of his return to Crimea after that. Thus, this information suggests that Fedor Kostenko disappeared on the mainland of Ukraine. Ukrainian law enforcement authorities opened a criminal case under Part 1, Article 115 of the Criminal Code of Ukraine «intended murder». Fedor Kostenko is listed on the website of MIA of Ukraine in the «Disappeared Citizens» section.

Other cases of disappearances have been fixed in Crimea (Eskender Apselyamov, Bilyal Bilyalov, Arlen Terekhov, Ruslan Ganiev, Arsen Aliev, Abdurahmon Ayubov and other), but at this moment there are not clearly identified signs of enforced disappearances in these cases.



ABOUT US

The Crimean Human Rights Group (CHRG) is an organization of the Crimean human rights defenders and journalists, the purpose of which is to promote the observance and protection of human rights in Crimea by attracting widespread attention to the problems of human rights and international humanitarian law in the territory of the Crimean peninsula, as well as the search and development of mechanisms to protect the human rights in Crimea.

The **CHRG** first of all obey the rules of basic documents in the field of human rights, such as: the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Helsinki Final Act, the Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on economic, social and cultural Rights and others.

The main objectives of the CHRG:

- 1) Collection and analysis of the information regarding the human rights situation in the Crimea;
- Broad awareness among governments, international organizations, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, the media and other target groups through the publication and spreading of analytical and information materials on the human rights situation in Crimea;
- 3) Promote the protection of human rights and respect for international law in Crimea;
- 4) Preparation of recommendations for government authorities and international organizations in the sphere of human rights;
- 5) Providing the presence of «human rights in the Crimea topics» in the information space.

The CHRG's team consists of experts, human rights activists and journalists from different countries who are involved in monitoring and documenting human rights violations in Crimea, since February, 2014.

During preparation and spreading of the information the **CHRG** is guided by principles of objectivity, reliability and timeliness.

Monthly monitoring reviews of the Crimean Human Rights Group http://crimeahrg.org/category/monitor

Thematic reviews and articles of the Crimean Human Rights Group http://crimeahrg.org/category/analytic